To: Executive Faculty Council, Tactical Leadership Team, and Board of Trustees

From: Board Policy B.9.1/Leadership Framework Ad-Hoc Committee

Re: Recommendations as proposed by the Board Policy B.9.1/Leadership Framework Ad-Hoc Committee

Date: February 15, 2019

BACKGROUND: On January 17, 2017, the Alamo College District Board of Trustees approved changes to Policy B.9.1: Educational Philosophy –The Alamo Way: Always Inspire, Always Improve. The changes include the addition of a charge to faculty and administration at the five Colleges to accomplish the following work:

1) Collaborate with employers and ISD/university partners to determine their leadership program needs and current practices, respectively;
2) Recommend a single, District-wide leadership program that meets the needs of employers and ISD/university partners and to outline how this model will be taught to students at scale across the Alamo Colleges District; and
3) Monitor and evaluate the implementation of this action and recommend improvements and/or modifications over time to best meet the needs of our students and community.

The broad nature of this Board directive makes the Executive Faculty Council (EFC) an appropriate body to organize and initiate this work. The EFC will conceptualize a district-wide leadership model by identifying its components as well as the leadership skills that students will have achieved upon completing their goal in one of the Alamo INSTITUTES. The recommended leadership model should be supported by research conducted with employers and ISD/University partners, and informed by nationally-recognized successful leadership programs. The leadership model should be integrated into the student experience through the Pathways model, offering both in and out of the classroom opportunities. Students should also be able to articulate the leadership skills they have obtained to future employers and universities. The charge and recommended leadership model should be completed in the next several months. The various ways the model may be integrated into the classroom and other student experiences may be accomplished in several stages over the next 12-18months.

The EFC, in consultation with the Board Policy B.9.1/Leadership Framework Ad Hoc Committee, proposes these final recommendations to the Tactical Leadership Team and Board of Trustees:

• Framework with two tiers of Knowledge, Skills, and Abilities (KSA's) attainment

• Assessment of student learning

• Documentation with evidence of learning

- Faculty and staff development

- Student awareness campaign

Enclosed with this cover letter is an Executive Summary of these recommendations and a report detailing the basis for these recommendations.

Executive Summary

Charge and Work Proposal:

1) Create a work plan with timeline for conducting the research, and identifying the framework and objectives of the leadership model.
2) Conduct research to identify the leadership needs of employers.
3) Conduct research to identify what K-12, universities, and nationally-recognized leadership programs are currently using as a leadership model.
4) Conduct research to identify how each College is currently helping students gain leadership knowledge and skills, both inside and outside of the classroom.
5) Recommend a single, District-wide leadership model framework with outcomes that meets the needs of employers and aligns with leadership models used by ISD/university partners.

Recommendation #1: Framework with two tiers of KSA's attainment

Each college will create a leadership development program that is available to all students. The leadership development program should have two tiers, each addressing a different level of attainment of a shared set of knowledge, skills, and abilities (KSAs). The KSAs reflect outcomes that are highly desired by employers, and aligned with our community ISD and university leadership programs.

Key KSAs: Critical Thinking, Effective Communication, Social Responsibility, Teamwork, Personal Responsibility

Recommendation #2: Assessment

All colleges are committed to assessing the student leadership training, and each college will assess student attainment of leadership KSAs in both tier 1 and tier 2 programs.

Recommendation #3: Documentation

Each college will collect and archive assessed evidence of student progress in each Tier. Students will have access to the archived, assessed evidence for two years after graduation or transfer.

Completion of each Tier will be documented.

Recommendation #4: Faculty and Staff Development

District HR / Training, faculty, staff and Faculty Development Faculty Fellows at each college will create faculty and staff development as needed for the leadership development programs at each college.

Recommendation #5: Awareness Campaign for Students

Students will be made aware of the leadership program available at their college prior to enrolling in their first term. Awareness campaign can be included in New Student Orientation

(required of all incoming students) and in one of the Advising Touchpoints (students are required to meet with their advisor at 15, 30, and 45 hours in order to get a PIN)

Introduction

This report presents the work of the Board Policy B.9.1/Leadership Framework Ad Hoc Committee. On January 17, 2017, the Alamo College District Board of Trustees approved changes to Policy B.9.1: Educational Philosophy –The Alamo Way: Always Inspire, Always Improve. The changes include the addition of a charge to faculty and administration at the five Colleges to accomplish the following work:

1) Collaborate with employers and ISD/university partners to determine their leadership program needs and current practices, respectively;
2) Recommend a single, District-wide leadership program that meets the needs of employers and ISD/university partners and to outline how this model will be taught to students at scale across the Alamo Colleges District; and
3) Monitor and evaluate the implementation of this action and recommend improvements and/or modifications over time to best meet the needs of our students and community.

The broad nature of this Board directive makes the Executive Faculty Council (EFC) an appropriate body to organize and initiate this work. The EFC will conceptualize a district-wide leadership model by identifying its components as well as the leadership skills that students will have achieved upon completing their goal in one of the AlamoINSTITUTES. The recommended leadership model should be supported by research conducted with employers and ISD/University partners, and informed by nationally-recognized successful leadership programs. The leadership model should be integrated into the student experience through the Pathways model, offering both in and out of the classroom opportunities. Students should also be able to articulate the leadership skills they have obtained to future employers and universities. The charge and recommended leadership model should be completed in the next several months. The various ways the model may be integrated into the classroom and other student experiences may be accomplished in several stages over the next 12-18months.

Members

The members of the ad-hoc team included:

- Tiffany Cox Hernandez—SAC
- Joseph Coppola—PAC
- Cynthia Katz—SPC
- Adam O. Aguirre—NVC
- Dianna Torres Lee—NLC
- Michael Lee Gardin—NVC

- Veronica Rosas-Tatum—PAC
- Migdalia Garcia—NVC
- Katherine Doss—PAC
- Marlon Anderson—NLC
- Franc Solis—SAC
- Paul Machen—SPC

Timeframe

The timeframe of this work spanned from March, 2017 to February 2019.

The following sections provide details about our research efforts, the results we obtained, the conclusions we drew from these results, and our recommendations.

Research and Findings

In order to complete the research portion of our charge, the ad-hoc committee broke down the research into three clear categories:

1) Needs of employers
2) Best practices of K-12, community colleges, universities, and nationally-recognized leadership programs
3) How each of the Alamo Colleges is currently helping students gain leadership knowledge and skills.

For the "needs of employers" the ad-hoc team utilized information from the Association of American Colleges & Universities' (AACU) Employer Survey, the 2012 Leadership Forum held at St. Phillip's College, and the O*Net Online tools. Additionally, in the Summer of 2018 we held a summer "listening event" with local employers and industry leaders including Toyota and H-E-B and others. Our research in this area indicated the employers are primarily concerned with the kind of marketable skills our colleges are already teaching and assessing: critical thinking, communication, teamwork, etc. See Appendix A for example of raw data from the aforementioned summer "listening event."

For the "best practices of K-12, community colleges, universities, and nationally-recognized leadership program" our team worked with the AACU Leadership Council, representatives from Creighton University, University of Texas at San Antonio (UTSA), EISD, NISD, NEISD, Dallas Community College District, and we held a Fall listening event in September of 2018 specifically with representatives from local "Leader in Me" Schools. Our research in this area revealed a wide variety of programs, the most successful of which had clear objectives and assessments. See Appendix B for example of raw data from UTSA.

For the "Alamo Colleges" portion of this research our teamed worked with the Palo Alto College Coordinator of Measurement & Evaluation, the San Antonio College Director of Learning Assessment, the St. Phillip's College Center for Learning Resources, the Northwest Vista College Coordinator of Measurement & Evaluation, and the Northeast Lakeview Coordinator of Academic Assessment. Additionally, we evaluated leadership development examples on the program and department levels as well as examined curricular and co-curricular opportunities, alignment of institutional learning outcomes, and assessment measures used. Lastly, we explored the District's Student Leadership Institute and worked in tandem with Ms. Rodell Asher and her "Principal Centered Leadership" committee as they developed definitions and criteria for "leadership." Our extensive research in this area revealed that the colleges and district are providing a plethora of opportunity for students to develop as leaders. See Appendix C for example of raw data from Northwest Vista College on existing leadership development initiatives.

Recommendations

1) Recommendation #1: A leadership development program will be developed that is available to all students' at all five colleges. The leadership program will utilize the exact same KSAs across all five colleges to ensure that students who move from college to college will benefit equally from this program. The leadership development program will have two tiers, each addressing a different level of attainment of a shared set of knowledge, skills, and abilities (KSAs). The KSAs reflect outcomes that are highly desired by employers, and aligned with our community ISD and university leadership programs.
Key KSAs will include Critical Thinking, Effective Communication, Social Responsibility, Teamwork, and Personal Responsibility.

       1a) Each KSA has a list of sub-competencies seen here:

Critical Thinking	Effective Communication	Social Responsibility	Teamwork	Personal Responsibility
- information literacy - deep understanding of what data, information, or research is and its application - innovation and creativity - synthesizes information to provide sound conclusions - analyzes complex problems	- clear written communication - clear oral communication - actively listens to others	- demonstrates ethical judgement and integrity - a sense of responsibility to a global community - social accountability - participation in intentional service activity - service to the community - ethical and equitable decision-making - social awareness	- works well in teams - emotional intelligence or adapts to emotional climate of others - manages interpersonal conflicts - comfort working with diverse people - develop relationships	- able to self-regulate - personal work values-ethic - personal goals - self-motivated - a commitment to life-long learning - self-reflection

       1b) Tier 1 is a student-centered, introductory level open to all students. Students

in Tier 1 will be introduced to, and will demonstrate an understanding of the KSAs they need to be accountable for and successful throughout their academic journey. In Tier 1: Students learn to…

- take personal responsibility for their own learning,
- communicate with other students, faculty, staff, and community partners,
- understand the importance of critical thinking, and
- understand how their own behavior impacts the communities in which they live.

1c) Tier 2 focuses on applied leadership, especially at the community level. Students will self-select for participation at this tier. In Tier 2, students may apply the leadership KSAs…

- in classes,
- in extra-curricular and co-curricular activities,
- through engagement with the community, and
- through opportunities to engage with university and workforce partners in their chosen pathway.

1d) Recommendation 1 *actions* include:

- Each college will create a Tier 1 program that can be completed by a student upon completing their first 2 semesters of consecutive attendance.
- Each college will create a Tier 2 program that can be completed by a student after completing Tier 1.
- Both faculty and staff will serve on the implementation committees at each college. College implementation committees will develop a mechanism for sharing their work with each other.
- Implementation Target: Fall 2019

- Recommendation #2: All colleges are committed to assessing the student leadership training, and each college will assess student attainment of leadership KSAs in both tier 1 and tier 2 programs.
  2) 2a) Each college will create and utilize a common rubric for the college to assess leadership KSA's at each tier. Implementation Target: Spring 2020.

3) Recommendation #3: Each college will collect and archive assessed evidence of student progress in each tier. Students will have access to the archived, assessed evidence for two years after graduation or transfer. Completion of each tier will be documented.
   3a) Each college will identify a common method for collecting and archiving assessed evidence of student progress in each tier. Each college will determine a means of documenting completion of each tier. Implementation Target: Spring 2020.

4) Recommendation #4: District HR/Training, faculty, staff, and Faculty Development Faculty Fellows at each college will create faculty and staff development surrounding the leadership development programs at each college.

>4a) Establish implementation teams, tasked with assessment and including: Associate Vice Chancellor of Human Resources, Vice Presidents, Deans, Institute leads, Faculty and Staff representatives from college implementation committees and Faculty Development Fellows

5) Recommendation #5: Students will be made aware of the leadership program available at their college prior to enrolling in the first term. The awareness campaign can be included in New Student Orientation (required of all incoming students) and in one of the Advising Touchpoints (students are required to meet with their advisor at 15, 30, and 45 hours in order to get a PIN).

>5a) Each college will commit to developing, implementing, and assessing an on-going awareness campaign for students regarding their leadership program. Implementation Target: Fall 2019.

Conclusion

Based on the extensive research summarized above, the Board Policy B.9.1/Leadership Framework Ad-Hoc team, with the formal endorsement of the Executive Faculty Council, officially recommends the framework and resultant implementation actions included here.

References

The Seven Habits of Highly Effective People, Covey, S. (2004). New York: Free Press.

O*Net Online, U.S. Department of Labor. www.onetonline.org.

Job Outlook 2016, National Association of Colleges and Employers (2015). Pennsylvania: www.naceweb.org.

Leading the Way, Leadership Forum Report. St. Phillip's College. 2012.

AACU and Hart Research Associates (Key Findings Report), Association of American Colleges and Universities (2014). www.aacu.org/leap; www.aacu.org/leap/public-opinion-research.

Student Leadership Institute Overview. Rodell Asher. Alamo Community Colleges District.

Principle Centered Leadership Final Recommendations. Rodell Asher. Alamo Community Colleges District.

2016 Alamo Colleges Stakeholders' Strategic Planning Retreat Report. www.alamo.edu/planning.

Innovative Leadership, Where leaders ignite their power in an innovative economy. Northside Chamber of Commerce Leadership Brochure.

The Student Leadership Center. Howard, E. University of Texas at San Antonio.

AlamoCONFIDENCE Employer Listening Session Final Feedback. D'Amico, S. (2018). San Antonio: Alamo Colleges District.

Creighton University Leadership B.S. http://catalog.creighton.edu/undergraduate/professional-studies/leadership-bs/#text. Billings, C.

College Learning for the New Global Century, AACU National Leadership Council (2007). www.aacu.org/leap/national-leadership-council. www.aacu.org/sites/default/files/files/LEAP/GlobalCentury_final.pdf

Student Leadership Institute. Eldridge, C. Northlake College.

EISD, NISD, and NEISD Report on Leadership Programs. Rogers, R; Allen, S. (2018).

Leader In Me Listening Event. Region 20 Leader In Me Schools. (2018).

KSA Program Examples. Northeast Lakeview College. Northwest Vista College, Palo Alto College, San Antonio College, St. Phillip's College (2019).

Appendix A—Summer Listening Event with Local Employers Feedback

AlamoCONFIDENCE Table Discussion Feedback 8/6/18

Table Discussion Activity Instructions:

Participants were asked to sit with their respective AlamoINSTITUTE. Participants were asked to list the ten most important soft skills / leadership skills for entry level employees in each AlamoINSTITUTE, and rank them with the most important ranked No. 1. Table recorders were asked to capture their table's feedback, and table reporters were asked to explain their table's rankings to the larger audience. Tables also were asked to provide concrete examples of what each skill looked like for entry level employees in their organizations.

Business & Entrepreneurship Group 1[1]

1. Verbal Communication
2. Listening
3. Emotional intelligence
4. Critical Thinking
5. Interpersonal Relationships
6. Collaborating
7. Time Management
8. Adaptability
9. Decision Making
10. Business Ethics

Business & Entrepreneurship Group 2

1. Listening
2. Team Building
3. Managing
4. Collaborating
5. Conflict Resolution
6. Personal Branding
7. Emotional intelligence
8. Problem Solving
9. Customer Service
10. Business Ethics

---

[1] *Duplicate items in each INSTITUTE group are highlighted in yellow*

Appendix A—Summer Listening Event with Local Employers Feedback (continued)

Health & Biosciences Group 1

1. Communicate / Listen
2. Customer Service
3. Emotional Intelligence
4. Diversity

Health & Biosciences Group 2

1. Verbal Communication
2. Listening
3. Facilitation
4. Collaboration
5. Interpersonal Relationships
6. Tolerance of Change and Uncertainty
7. Empathy
8. Organization
9. Diversity Awareness
10. Customer Service

Public Service Group 1

1. Emotional Intelligence
2. Communication
3. Business Etiquette
4. Critical Thinking

Public Service Group 2

1. Listening
2. Adaptability
3. Problem Solving
4. Diversity Awareness

Appendix A—Summer Listening Event with Local Employers Feedback (continued)

Science & Technology Group 1

1. Adaptability
2. Critical Thinking
3. Listening
4. Taking Criticism

Science & Technology Group 2

1. Communications Skills
2. Leadership
3. Personal / Interpersonal Skills
4. Creativity

Advanced Manufacturing & Logistics

1. Self-Leadership
2. Listening
3. Following instructions
4. Critical Thinking
5. Decision Making
6. Collaboration
7. Time Management
8. Team Building

Appendix B—Report of Data from UTSA Leadership Program

Leadership Program Research

Program name	The University of Texas at San Antonio
Source	The Student Leadership Center
Program contact information	Dr. Eliot Howard Associate Director of Student Leadership Development 210-458-7967 Eliot.howard@utsa.edu

1. The Leadership Program

The center hopes to develop students into leaders committed to life-long learning, community engagement, and active citizenship (positively impacting the campus, local, national, and global community). The center's programming has been designed around three corresponding touchstones: living, learning, and leading.

Living

This programming is guided by "The Leadership Community Values" of honest and open communication, self-examination, support, commitment to hang in there, inclusion, energy, and a willingness to learn from each other. The objectives of the programming are for students to:

- Gain new knowledge about essential connections between leadership and service
- Develop your own identity and philosophy as a leader
- Actively participate in creating community among your fellow residents on the floor
- Embrace various opportunities offered by the broader UTSA campus community
- Remain focused on academic success and become an outstanding UTSA graduate

The major program here is being part of a Leadership & Service Floor Community (of Alvarez Hall, student residence). Residents must attend meetings with the hall and actively participate in a minimum of 4 community opportunities each semester which include: Student Leadership Center programs and events, UTSA campus community events and programs, Floor programs and events, and Volunteer Services department projects, programs, and event. (Here are some examples: The Active Citizen workshop Demo Kitchen events in partnership with the UTSA Rec Center, True Colors workshop, Financial Aid and Academic Advising workshops, Various Leadership Development programs and events, Blanket Making Party Service Project, Extreme Makeover UTSA Edition, and Outdoor Adventure Day.)

Appendix B—Report of Data from UTSA Leadership Program (continued)

Learning

The learning aspect of the center's work involves two main components, a Civil Rights and Social Justice Trip and an undergraduate course.

The trip immerses students in the history of the Civil Rights Movement by visiting historical markers (such as the 9th Ward, the Civil Rights Institute, the National Civil Rights Museum, etc.,) and it concludes with students participating in the MLK March back in San Antonio, TX

The undergraduate course is titled Introduction to Leadership: EDL 3003. The text used is *Leadership: Theory and Practice* (7th Ed.) by Peter Northouse and published by Sage.

The learning objectives of the course are for students to be able to:
- Describe, compare and contrast historical and contemporary leadership theories
- Articulate and refine a personal understanding of the what, how and why (processes, practices, and purposes) of leadership
- Identify essential leadership competencies and self-assess your proficiency with respect to those competencies
- Create a self-improvement plan related to at least two of those leadership competencies
- Apply your understanding of leadership theory to a small group service learning project

*Please see attachment A for more. It is a sample syllabus.

Leading

As seen above, various events, workshops, etc. are put on by the center and available to all UTSA students while also concurrently supporting the students who part of the residence hall, who plan to attend the trip, or who are enrolled in the course.

The center also sends students to nationally recognized leadership conferences (the Texas Conference for Women and the National Collegiate Leadership Conference). Finally, the center runs a storytelling series, aimed quite simply at having communicate their experiences as a member of the UTSA community.

2. The Outcomes

The center has developed six-item Leadership Competency Inventory for all their activities and initiatives developed based upon the Texas Higher Education Coordinating Board Core Curriculum and NACE employer prioritized competencies

Leadership Competency Inventory
- **Communication Skills** - effective development, interpretation and expression of ideas through written, oral, and visual communication; relationship-building with peers and conflict management apply to working together with others, non-hierarchically.
- **Personal Responsibility** - ability to connect choices, actions and consequences to ethical decision-making

Appendix B—Report of Data from UTSA Leadership Program (continued)

3

- **Social Responsibility** - intercultural competence, knowledge of civic responsibility, and the ability to engage effectively in regional, national, and global communities; valuing diversity in ourselves and those around us means appreciating difference for how it enriches our lives and enhances our communities. Inclusion also extends to valuing social justice and standing as an ally against oppression and exclusion.
- **Teamwork** - ability to consider different points of view and to work effectively with others to support a shared purpose or goal; Organizing and strengthening groups entails effectively using an understanding of context, norms, ethics, priorities, needs and resources to guide and empower a group.
- **Cognitive Complexity** – critical and creative thinking, innovation, inquiry, and analysis, evaluation and synthesis of information
- **Informed Decision-Making** - empirical and quantitative skills; manipulation and analysis of numerical data or observable facts resulting in informed conclusions

*Please see Attachment B for an example of a program outline, or how the competencies are introduced to students.

3. Data

While the data was not shared with us, the center does collect data through a self-assessment survey given at the end of each workshop, conference, or other leadership programming.

Survey Contents:

1. Identify your level with respect to this competency prior to today's workshop and after.
2. How will what you learned in this workshop support your academic success and persistence?
3. What will you accomplish based on this meeting? In other words, what is your Specific, Measurable, Attainable, Relevant and Time-lined (SMART) goal?
4. What did you most appreciate about today's workshop?
5. What could we improve about today's workshop?
6. How did you hear about today's workshop?

*Please see Attachment B for one example of the survey.

4. Campus Context

The center clearly receives support and funding from the institution, as it has three full time staff (Director, Associate Director, and Program Coordinator). By in large, though, the ideas and materials comes from UTSA personnel. In other words, no extensive materials or outside consultants (to my knowledge) are required for or used in the program.

Appendix C—Data from Northwest Vista College Regarding Current Leadership Development Initiatives

Conduct research to identify how each College is currently helping students gain leadership knowledge and skills-Focus on opportunities offered outside of the classroom.

Northwest Vista College					
Program/Event/Classroom Experience	Department	Co-Curricular/Inside Classroom	Alignment to Institutional Learning Outcomes (if applicable)	Assessment Measures Used	Description of Program
Learning to Lead	Student Life	Co-Curricular	Teamwork, Personal Responsibility, Communication,	Pre and Post Surveys	A three- tiered certification program that allows students to enhance their leadership and professional skills via various trainings, workshops, and community service.
Service- Learning	Community Engagement	Co-Curricular	Personal and Social Responsibility, Critical Thinking	Reflection papers as well as community satisfaction surveys	Throughout the year faculty, require students to participate in service projects connected to their classroom objectives and outcomes. Students give of their time and talent at various community partner agencies.
Business Leaders Career Coaching Program	Institutional Advancement	Co-Curricular	Personal Responsibility	Post Surveys Short reflection questions after each session	Connect students with business partners to enhance their educational, professional, leadership, and ethical development through use of a mentor
Community Based Work-Study	Experiential Learning	Co-Curricular	Communication, Personal and	Extensive Survey by both student and employer	Community Based Work-Study Programs affords students the opportunity to work at a local non-profit to gain work experience instead of the traditional on campus placement.
Community Service	Student Life/ Community Engagement	Co-Curricular	Personal and Social Responsibility	Short Reflection questions	Episodic volunteer opportunities for students to connect with community projects.
Phi Theta Kappa	Student Life	Co-Curricular	Personal Responsibility, Critical Thinking	Specific quantities standards need to be met	An Honor Society that is devoted to cultivating student leadership and development.
National Society for Leadership and Success	Student Life	Co- Curricular	Critical Thinking, Personal Responsibility	Specific quantitative standards must be met	An Honor Society who encourages personal growth, community action and strong leadership. Member participate in leadership seminars and service.
College Ambassadors	Student Life	Co-Curricular	Communication, Teamwork	End of semester assessment	Students serve as role models and experts in supporting Enrollment Service in recruitments events and lead campus tours
Cat Crew and Student Programming Board	Student Life	Co-Curricular	Empirical and Quantitative Skill, Personal Responsibility, Teamwork	Feedback sessions	The student programming board is responsible for coordinating and planning activities that engage students and enhance their educational, social ,cultural and recreational aspects of their college experience